Access Pattern disclosure on Searchable Encryption: Ramification, Attack and Mitigation

Murat Kantarcioglu Joint work with Mohammad Saiful Islam, Mehmet Kuzu,



Introduction



NDSS Symposium 2012



Introduction



Existing Protocols

• Oblivious RAM Type Protocols (ORAM)

- E.g., Goldreich et. al., Williams et. al.
- Secure: reveals no information to an adversary.
- Too expensive for large data sets.

Efficient Searchable Encryption Protocols

– E.g., Song et. al., Goh et. al., Curtmola et. al.

- Efficient: practically usable.
- Reveals Access Patterns.



Access Pattern Disclosure



A Searchable Encryption Protocol that reveals Access Pattern

NDSS Symposium 2012



Contributions

- Investigate the ramification of Access Pattern Disclosure.
- Formalize a query identity inference attack model based on access pattern disclosure.
- > Empirically verify the efficacy of such a model.
- Propose a noise addition technique to mitigate such an attack.



Simplified Searchable Encryption





Motivation



- Mallory can calculate the probability of {'New York', 'Yankees'} to appear in a document.
- What if the document corpus is about Major league baseball?

Notations

Notation	Meaning
D _i	The i th Document.
К _i	The i th Keyword.
n	Number of documents.
m	Number of keywords.
Q	Set of I queries $\langle Q_1,, Q_i \rangle$.
R _q	Result sent by the server for query q.
K _Q	The set of known queries.
S	Set of keywords for which queries are known.
Trapdoor _w	Output of the trapdoor function for w.



Threat Model

- Attacker Mallory has access to the communication channel. Therefore, she observes $Q = \langle Q_1, ..., Q_l \rangle$ and their responses $\langle R_{Q1}, ..., R_{Ql} \rangle$.
- Mallory knows the underlying keywords for a set of k queries: K_Q.
- Mallory has access to a (*m x m*) matrix *M* s.t. M_{i,j} = Pr
 [(Ҡ_i ∈ d) ∧ (Ҡ_j ∈ d)], here *d* is sampled uniformly from *D*.



Proposed Model

Objective: Given a set of queries Q, a set of known queries K_Q , a background matrix *M*, and the set of known keywords *S*; ascertain the sequence of indices $\langle a_1, ..., a_l \rangle$ s.t. the following holds.

$$\arg \min_{\langle a_{1}, \dots, a_{l} \rangle} \sum_{Q_{i}, Q_{j} \in Q} \left(\frac{R_{Q_{i}} \cdot R_{Q_{j}}^{T}}{n} - \left(K_{a_{i}} \cdot M \cdot K_{a_{j}}^{T} \right) \right)^{2}$$

Constraints $\forall j \ s.t. \ Q_{j} \in S, a_{j} = x_{j} \ s.t. \langle \kappa_{x_{j}}, Q_{j} \rangle \in K_{Q}$
 $\forall j, \|Q_{j}\| = 1$

UTD

NP Completeness Theorem: Theorem 1

Finding an optimal assignment of keywords to a given set of queries w.r.t. the objective function defined in the simplified model is NP-Complete.



Experimental Setup

- Datasets Used: 30109 emails contained in the Enron Dataset _sent_mail folder.
 Discarded the first few lines of metadata.
- Stemming Algorithm: Used Porter Stemming Algorithm to find the root of each keyword.
- Simulated Annealing: Used Simulated Annealing to solve the approximation of the simplified model.

Experimental Setup Contd.

- Keyword Generation: We use the most frequent x keywords as our keyword set.
 - Discarded the most common words like a, an ,the etc.
- Query Generation: We use Zipfian distribution to generate Query Set.
- Execution Time: All the experiments ran under 14 hours in a AMD Phenom II X6 1045T 2.70 GHz Windows 7 with 8 GB RAM.



Experiment Results



Parameters

- Query Set Size: 150
- Known Query Set Size:15% of Query Set Size.
- # Documents: 30109

Parameters

- Keyword Set Size: 1500
- Known Query Set Size: 15%
- # Documents: 30109



Experiment Results Contd.



Parameters

- Keyword Set Size: 1500
- Query Set Size: 150
- # Documents: 30109



Experiment Results Contd.



Parameters

- Keyword Set Size: 1500
- Query Set Size: 150
- # Documents: 30109

Noise Addition:

- $\sigma^2 = Var\{M_{i,i}\}$
- Add Noise: $N(0, C\sigma^2)$
- C is noise scaling factor



Mitigating Inference Attack

Propose a simple noise addition based technique to counter against the attacks discussed in our work.

Can work on any searchable encryption that leaks data access pattern.



Outline





Outline



UTD

Privacy Definition: (α , 0)-secure Index



Experiment Results



Parameters

- Keyword Set Size: 1500
- Query Set Size: 150
- Known Query: 15%
- # Documents: 30109

Parameters

- Keyword Set Size: 1500
- Query Set Size: 150
- Known Query: 15%
- # Documents: 30109





Access Pattern can be exploited to infer sensitive information.

Simple noise addition based schemes can thwart some of the attacks successfully.





Thank You.

FEARLESS engineering

NDSS Symposium 2012

